SLOs: Assessment & Alignment of Outcomes

San Bernardino Valley College
January 10, 2013

David W. Marshall, PhD
California State University-San Bernardino
Overview

- Two Cultures: A Contrast in Emphasis
- Defining Student Learning Outcomes
- Principles of Program Assessment
- What’s the Benefit?
Two cultures: A contrast in approaches

Elements of Design
“Assessment” of What?

ACCJC Standard II.A.1.c

The institution identifies student learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates, and degrees; assesses student achievement of those outcomes; and uses assessment results to make improvements.
“Assessment” of What?

ACCJC Standard II.A.1.c
The institution identifies student learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates, and degrees; assesses student achievement of those outcomes; and uses assessment results to make improvements.

ACCJC Standard II.A.2.h
The institution awards credit based on student achievement of the course’s stated learning outcomes. Units of credit are consistent with institutional policies that reflect generally accepted norms or equivalencies in higher education.
“Assessment” of What?

**Assessment of Student Learning**

**Who:** for students

**What:** how much students have learned

**When:** throughout each semester

**Where:** in classes using assignments in which students demonstrate their learning

**Why:** to evaluate whether students have gained proficiency that prepares them to advance to a next course
## “Assessment” of What?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment of Student Learning</th>
<th>Assessment of Program Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Who: for students</td>
<td>Who: for ourselves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What: how much students have learned</td>
<td>What: how much we have taught or how successful programs are</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When: throughout each semester</td>
<td>When: each year, selectively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where: in classes</td>
<td>Where: in non-academic/technical units</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How: using assignments in which students demonstrate their learning</td>
<td>How: using direct &amp; indirect data (assignment results &amp; surveys)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why: to evaluate whether students have gained proficiency that prepares them to advance to a next course</td>
<td>Why: to evaluate the extent to which our curricula, pedagogies, activities, and support systems are encouraging student success</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Assessment Cycle

1. Identify Assessments
2. Gather Results
3. Analyze Results
4. Strategize Program Improvement
5. Write Outcomes
6. Identify Assessments
7. Gather Results
8. Analyze Results
9. Strategize Program Improvement
10. Write Outcomes
Perception of the Assessment Cycle

Submit Reports  →  Write Outcomes

Package Results  ↯  Identify Assessments

Gather Results  ↯  ACCREDITATION
The Culture of Compliance

Students become unimportant elements of the assessment process

- Sees accreditation as an end in itself
- Seeks information on what accreditors want to see
- Worries about whether what they have matches accreditors’ expectations
Another View of the Assessment Cycle

- Communicate Expectations to Students
- Collect Student Work
- Determine Extent of Learning
- Strategize New Student Success Plans
- Name Expectations for Learning

STUDENTS
The Culture of Intentionality

Students become the primary focus of the assessment process

- Is student-centered
- Seeks information about how well students are learning
- Reflects on what we teach & how we teach it and how we support student learning
- Accepts (some) responsibility for student success
- Experiments with new strategies for student success
The Core: Student Learning Outcomes

A student learning outcome…is…defined in terms of the particular levels of knowledge, skills and abilities that a student has attained at the end (or as a result) of his or her engagement in a particular set of collegiate experiences.

(Peter Ewell, 2001)
A student learning outcome...is...defined in terms of the particular levels of knowledge, skills and abilities that a student has attained at the end (or as a result) of his or her engagement in a particular set of collegiate experiences.

(Peter Ewell, 2001)
Learning Outcomes are goals that describe how a student will be different because of a learning experience. More specifically, learning outcomes are the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and habits of mind that students take with them from a learning experience.

(Linda Suskie, 2009).
Student Learning Outcomes: The Student Perspective

*Learning Outcomes* are goals that describe how a student will be different because of a learning experience. More specifically, learning outcomes are the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and habits of mind that students take with them from a learning experience.

(Suskie, 2009)
Student Learning Outcomes: The Student Perspective

*Learning Outcomes* are goals that describe how a student will be different because of a learning experience. More specifically, learning outcomes are the knowledge, skills, attitudes, and habits of mind that students take with them from a learning experience.

(Suskie, 2009).
Intentionality & the SLO

Outcomes offer students goals:

- SLOs make explicit for students what will be expected of them so they know what to expect.
- Students are not required to intuit what learning is expected.
“Assessment” of What?

ACCJC Standard II.A.1.c

The institution identifies student learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates, and degrees; assesses student achievement of those outcomes; and uses assessment results to make improvements.
An Integrated Foundation for Assessment

Defining Student Learning Outcomes
Objects of Learning Outcomes

- **Content**: facts, concepts, principles/theories

- **Skills**:
  - **Cognitive**: information literacy, thinking strategies, computational skills
  - **Social/Interaction**: communication skills, collaboration skills, initiative/leadership skills
  - **Aesthetic**: arts appreciation, proficiency in creative procedures, creativity

- **Values**: open-mindedness/love of knowledge, diligence/integrity, social responsibility
Objects of Learning Outcomes

- **Content:** facts, concepts, principles/theories

- **Skills:**
  - **Cognitive:**
    - information literacy, thinking strategies, computational skills
  - **Social:**
    - communication skills, collaboration skills, initiative/leadership skills
  - **Aesthetic:**
    - arts appreciation, proficiency in creative procedures, creativity

- **Values:** open-mindedness/love of knowledge, diligence/integrity, social responsibility
Objects of Learning Outcomes

- **Content**: facts, concepts, principles/theories

- **Skills**:  
  - Cognitive: information literacy, thinking strategies, computational skills  
  - Social/Interaction: communication skills, collaboration skills, initiative/leadership skills  
  - Aesthetic: arts appreciation, proficiency in creative procedures, creativity

- **Values**: open-mindedness/love of knowledge, social responsibility, diligence/integrity
Learning outcomes include three key components that ensure clear communication:

- **Audience**: to whom the SLO pertains
- **Behavior**: what the audience is expected to know or be able to do
- **Context**: circumstances under which learning will take place
Upon completion of Physics 375, students will apply the laws of thermodynamics to solve relevant problems in physics.
An Outcome’s Components

Learning outcomes include three key components that ensure clear communication.

C  A  B

Upon completion of Physics 375, students will apply the laws of thermodynamics to solve relevant problems in physics.
Differentiating Outcome Types

Program Level Outcomes:
Broadly inclusive statements that might be considered areas of competency within a given discipline or general areas of competency within a GE program

Example 1: Content
Demonstrate knowledge of major psychological theories, concepts, testing and assessment strategies, research methodologies and therapeutic techniques, and their development over time.

Example 2: Skill
Utilize higher order thinking in applying basic research methods in psychology including research design, data analysis, and interpretation of findings, and, reporting of result both in written and oral forms that are in conformance with APA format.
Example 1
Identify basic research methods and ethical considerations in the study of behavior.

Example 2
Critique psychological studies and their study design, results and the conclusions reached by the researchers involved.

Example 3
Analyze the results of two different kinds of personality tests and birth order for college age adults especially introversions versus extraversion.

Differentiating Outcome Types
Student Learning Outcomes:
Specific statements that identify student responses to learning experiences and thereby indicate what learning looks like within a discrete area of a program.
Relating Outcomes

PLO: 1

Utilize higher order thinking in applying basic research methods in psychology including research design, data analysis, and interpretation of findings, and, reporting of result both in written and oral forms that are in conformance with APA format.

SLO 1.1: Identify basic research methods and ethical considerations in the study of behavior.

SLO 1.2: Analyze the results of two different kinds of personality tests and birth order for college age adults especially introversions versus extraversion.
### Relating Outcomes

| Culinary Arts AA Degree | Demonstrate to the instructor during the final exam how to use a knife and the basic knife cuts | Demonstrate how to calculate food costs as it applies to menus by pricing a menu as part of the final in this course | Demonstrate that they understand optimal quantity, price and standard specifications of ordering by completing a class project that showcases each component of purchasing | Demonstrate to the instructor by recalling the top five problems that the restaurant industry encounters on a final exam exam | Recall on a written exam how to derive the “Break-even Point” of a restaurant | Define and recall on a written exam the purchasing function | Recall the seven areas of an HACCP plan | Be prepared to transfer a core curriculum to an accredited, four-year college or university with junior class standing in Culinary Arts or a related major |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| CLASSES                 |                                                                                                 |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 010x4            |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 101              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 160              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 161              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 201              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 225              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 235              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 240              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 250              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |
| CULART 275              |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                |                                                                                                    |
SLO Pitfalls

Beware these frequent problems with outcomes statements to encourage stronger results.

- **Wordy statements**: be concise
- **Stacked outcomes**: be wary of including too many outcomes in a single statement
- **Procedural statements**: be aware of process-oriented constructions or assignment stipulations
- **Un-measurable outcomes**: be conscious of assessment possibilities for each outcome
- **Too many outcomes**: for every outcome there must be a means of measurement
Features of Effective SLOs

Employ these strategies for writing strong outcomes statements that communicate clearly what students will know and be able to do.

- Focus on learning, not processes or assignments
- Avoid vague verbs (*know, understand, demonstrate*)
- Use action verbs (*Bloom’s taxonomy*)
- Use verbs that reflect the level of learning
- Ensure that outcomes are observable and measurable
- State what students do (*not what instructors do*)
Using the SLOs for Compliance

The Culture of Compliance

- Rarely communicates SLOs to students
- Files SLOs with the appropriate office
- Sticks with what has always been done
- Works on SLO assessment for an accreditation cycle

The Culture of Intentionality

- Makes SLOs visible to students
- Incorporates SLOs into faculty practice
- Assesses SLOs appropriately
- Uses SLOs for ongoing conversations about teaching effectiveness
Using the SLOs for Intentionality

**The Culture of Compliance**
- Rarely communicates SLOs to students
- Files SLOs with the appropriate office
- Sticks with what has always been done
- Works on SLO assessment on the accreditation cycle

**The Culture of Intentionality**
- Makes SLOs visible to students
- Incorporates SLOs into faculty practice
- Assesses SLOs appropriately
- Uses SLOs for ongoing conversations about teaching effectiveness
Using the SLOs for Intentionality

Apply a departmental rubric to inform completion of the numerical data table below.

Numerical Data for tracking longitudinal performance.

Space to track instructor strategies as well as trends in student strengths and weaknesses.
Using the SLOs for Intentionality

SLO Assessment Data Collection Sheet
(Due to the Division Office each semester by Final Grade Submission Date)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Faculty Name:</th>
<th>Mandi Batalo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department:</td>
<td>AE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semester/Year Assessed:</td>
<td>Fall 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course:</td>
<td>Art145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section:</td>
<td>01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Units:</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Outcomes**

- SLO 1: The student will be able to identify the elements of design to create a visually appealing Illustrator document.
- SLO 2: The student will be able to identify fonts under two major categories, serif and sans serif, and use fonts within these categories convey an intended message.

**Assessment Methods**

- SLO 1: Course projects
- SLO 2: Course projects

**Criteria — what is “good enough”?**

- Students complete projects with a grade of 70% or better

**Enter the distribution of student SLO assessment results. Is this distribution satisfactory?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Draft: Generic Rubric for use if Departmental or Faculty Rubric is Not Available.</th>
<th>Total number of students enrolled in the class</th>
<th>Number of students who met the SLO</th>
<th>Number of students who did not meet the SLO</th>
<th>Number of students who did not assess</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SLO 1</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLO 2</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Reflect and comment on the successes and challenges in this class. Did you:**

- Try new strategies?
- Add content?
- See notable improvement in class performance?
- Identify any learning gaps?
- In future will you
- Try new strategies?
- Make recommendations for content, assessment, or SLO modification?

**Through projects and textbook tutorials the students do understand the elements of design. Sharing each students’ project with the entire class during class critiques helps in their understanding.**

**Learning gaps:**

Typography is a challenge. Many students are more interested in drawing or design than type design. Need to spend more time locking a cohesive design where type is the prominent element.
Assessment’s Big Payoff: Innovation

Creating Meaningful Change
Innovating Around Success:

- Consider increasing expectations or rigor outlined in SLOs
- Raise the standard of attainment
- Consider surveying students about their experience of the program
- Consider surveying others in the discipline/profession

We Did It!

Assessment may find that student learning meets expectations at the determined standard for some outcomes
Innovating to Address Shortcomings:

Curricular Issues

- Ensure PLOs/SLOs are clear and aligned with expectations
- Review and revise teaching & learning methods used by faculty
- Review and revise course content
- Revise or establish pre-requisites
- Review and revise course sequences
Innovating to Address Shortcomings:

Administrative Issues

- Develop advising systems for students
- Appoint coordinators for multi-section courses
- Review outlines for multi-section courses
- Build systems for communicating expectations to students

What Happened?

Assessment may find that student learning does not meet expectations at the determined standard for some outcomes
Responding to the Results

Students benefit from an institution’s thoughtful response to an honestly undertaken attempt to determine a program’s strengths and weaknesses in educating them.
To Conclude

With an approach that strives for student-centered intentionality, compliance becomes a matter of completing forms and writing narratives. Accreditation thereby takes care of itself.
Thank you
### Relating Outcomes

**Culinary Arts AA Degree**

- Demonstrate to the instructor during the final exam how to use a knife and the basic knife cuts
- Demonstrate how to calculate food costs as it applies to menus by pricing a menu as part of the final in this course
- Demonstrate that they understand optimal quantity, price and standard specifications of ordering by completing a class project that showcases each component of purchasing
- Demonstrate to the instructor by recalling the top five problems that the restaurant industry encounters on a final exam
- Recall on a written exam how to derive the “Break-even Point” of a restaurant
- Define and recall on a written exam the purchasing function
- Recall the seven areas of an HACCP plan
- Be prepared to transfer a core curriculum to an accredited, four-year college or university with junior class standing in Culinary Arts or a related major

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLASSES</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CULART 010x4</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 101</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 160</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 161</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 201</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 225</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 235</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 240</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 250</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CULART 275</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Refining Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STUDENT SUCCESS CENTER/TUTORING</th>
<th>In keeping with our belief that students’ academic success is achieved as a result of understanding and developing their unique processes as learners, the Tutoring Department provides quality instructional assistance and services to our diverse student population.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing Assessment Activity*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>